



UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION I

J.F. KENNEDY FEDERAL BUILDING, BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS 02203-2211

N62578.AR.000496
NCBC DAVISVILLE
5090.3a

August 10, 1995

Mr. Phil Otis
U.S. Department of the Navy
Northern Division - NAVFAC
10 Industrial Highway
Code 1811/PO - Mail Stop 82
Lester, PA 19113-2090

Re: EPA Comments Final Engineering Evaluation/Cost Analysis
(EE/CA) for Site 04 at CBC Davisville, Rhode Island, Dated 20
July 1995

Dear Mr. Otis:

Please find attached the Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA) comments on the above referenced document. The Navy issued the final EE/CA, prior to receiving EPA comments and opened the public comment period on July 31, 1995. Therefore, the attached comments must be entered into the Administrative Record and must be responded to in the Responsiveness Summary of the Action Memorandum for this EE/CA.

In addition, please note that the text of the draft Action Memorandum should reflect the language changes contained in the attached comments. In view of the large number of changes required in the ARAR tables (tables 2-3 to 2-5), please provide me with an advance copy of the tables as soon as the changes have been made.

We are interested in working with the Navy to enable transfer of this property as soon as possible. In order to do this, the post removal confirmation samples should be acquired in a manner which will allow them to be readily compared with the pre-removal action data. The confirmatory testing must be consistent with the previous TAL/TCL analytical testing.

I am looking forward to working with you to produce a removal action closeout report that can be easily incorporated into an FS and/or PRAP for this site. If you have any questions with regard to this letter, please contact me at (617) 573-5736.

Sincerely,

Christine A.P. Williams
Remedial Project Manager
Federal Facilities Superfund Section



Attachment

cc: Christi Davis, Northdiv
Judy Graham, RIDEM
Lou Fayan, NCBC
Tim Prior, USF&WL
Bob DiBiccaro, EPA
Jayne Michaud, EPA

EPA Comments on Final EE/CA for Site 4

General

1. Update the Region III risk-based concentrations using the Screening RBC tables for January-June 1995. Please note that for screening purposes, noncarcinogen values should be based on a hazard quotient of 0.1 not 1.0 to account for cumulative risks.
2. Spell check is needed (incl. tables).

Specific

3. Page 1; the Navy is performing a removal action, not remedial action at this site. The SASE report for Site 4 should have been included in the preparation of this EE/CA.
4. Page 2, section ES.1, second sentence; give examples of other potential contaminants at SA 4.
5. Page 3; has the Navy considered using the resulting asphalt batching materials on site to pave the existing road network? Five year reviews are required by the NCP if as a result of a **remedial** action contaminants are left on site that preclude unrestricted use. Previous EPA comment # 13 dated June 30, 1995, text should state that the no action alternative is not a permanent solution, was not addressed as was promised in Navy response to comments dated May 1995.
6. Page 6; additional graphics would enhance the understanding of this section.
7. Page 9; for consistency in approaches, compare the geometric means (g.m.) to the calculated arithmetic mean exposure point concentrations (EPCs). Indicate the factor above or below the g.m.-based risk is as compared to the arithmetic mean [for example, if risk = $1e-06$ at the g.m. and $4e-06$ at the arithmetic mean, indicate that the risk at the arithmetic mean is 4-fold higher than the g.m.]. This can be done as an appendix and tables, but discuss up front in the text.
8. Page 11; in the Pesticide/PCB section use the same concentration units.
9. Page 13, section 2.2.3; revise the first and second paragraphs to describe ARARs as, "ARARs are the applicable or relevant and appropriate requirements of Federal and more stringent promulgated requirements of State environmental statutes. The NTCRA must attain ARARs to the extent practicable. ARARs may be categorized as chemical-specific requirements that may define acceptable exposure levels and therefore be used in establishing clean-up goals; as location-specific requirements that may set restrictions on

activities within specific locations such as flood plains or wetlands; and as action-specific, which may set controls or restrictions for particular treatment and disposal activities related to the management of hazardous wastes. These categories are briefly defined and ARARs for this NTCRA are identified in this section and in tables 2-3 to 2-5."

10. Page 13, section 2.2.3; revise the last sentence in the third paragraph from, "...and CERCLA 121(d)(3)." to "...and CERCLA regulations that govern off-site management of CERCLA hazardous substances, pollutants or contaminants resulting from CERCLA decision documents signed after the enactment of SARA (40 CFR 300.440)."

11. Appendix E. Calculation for 95%UCLs. Explain what conclusions or inferences can be made, if any, from the statistical values shown in Columns M through S.

12. Replace all ARAR table headings of "Applicability to Site Conditions" to "Action to meet ARAR"

13. Change to Table 2-3: Delete State & federal Lead Guidance since there is no indication of lead exceeding action levels at this site.

14. Changes to Table 2-4

1. Delete Wetlands reference

2. Insert A-Replace Synopsis with the following insert for Endangered Species Act:

Remedial actions may not jeopardize the continued existence of endangered or threatened species, or adversely modify or destroy their critical habitats.

3. Insert B-Replace Action to Meet ARAR with the following insert for Endangered Species Act

Grasshopper sparrows, upland sandpipers and the least tern have been identified in the general area of the Asphalt Disposal Area, although not specifically on the Site. If any of these species are identified on the Site, appropriate measures will be taken during construction to ensure that the removal action does not adversely affect the species or its habitat. In addition, the restored Site may provide habitat for these species.

4. Delete Rhode Island Wetlands Laws reference

5. Insert C- Replace Action to Meet ARAR with the following insert for Cultural Resource Laws

Removal actions must be coordinated with preservation agencies and societies to minimize loss of significant scientific, prehistoric, historic or archaeological data.

15. Changes to Table 2-5:

1. Change the status of the Toxicity Characteristic regulation to relevant and appropriate.
2. Insert D - Replace action to Meet ARAR with the following insert for the LDRs

Waste materials will be evaluated to determine whether the waste is hazardous. If so, the materials will be treated in accordance with LDRs prior to disposal.

16. Changes to Table 2-6:

1. Delete the third entry, RCRA 264 & 265 general provisions since they are referenced specifically further on in the table
2. Change the Status for all the RCRA requirements to Relevant and Appropriate
3. The entries for the right column of 40 CFR 262, 40 CFR 263, and RCRA subparts B, C, D, G, I & X should each be revised to state this insert E:

The substantive provisions of this regulation will be met if the removal action addresses a waste which is a listed or characteristic waste under RCRA and which constitute current treatment, storage, or disposal as defined by RCRA.

4. delete the Federal RCRA Land Disposal Restrictions since they are included under chemical specific ARARs
5. Delete the entry for the Hazardous Materials Transportation Act since this action will be off-site.
6. Change the status of the Site Remediation regulations to be relevant and appropriate
7. Change the action to meet ARAR for the Site Remediation Regulations to read, "The design and operation of this removal action will comply with these

regulations."

8. Add to the RI Hazardous Waste Management Act of 1978 the Hazardous Waste Management Rules and Regulations with the status of relevant and appropriate

9. Add the following insert F to the Synopsis for the RI Haz Wst requirements

Rules and regulations for hazardous waste generation, transportation, treatment, storage and disposal. They incorporate by reference the relevant and appropriate federal RCRA requirements set forth above

10. Replace the Action taken to meet ARAR for both the RI Haz Wst requirements and the Public Right to Know Requirements with the following Insert G

The action will meet the substantive requirements of these regulations.

11. Add the RI Clean Air Act (RIGL, Title 23, Chapter 23), General Air Quality and Air Emissions Requirements, RI Air Pollution Control Regulations, RI Dept of Health, Div of Air Pollution Control, effective 8-2-67, most recently amended 5-20-91

12. Add the following regulations: Regulation No.1 - Visible Emissions, Regulation No. 5 - Fugitive Dust, Regulation No. 7 - Emissions Detrimental to Person or Property and Regulation No. 17 - Odors.

13. The status of each of the regulations cited in comment #16 (12) is Applicable.

14. Add the following insert for the Synopsis for Reg.#1

No air contaminant emissions will be allowed for more than 3 minutes in any one hour which are greater than or equal to 20% opacity.

15. Add the following insert for the Action to Meet ARAR for Reg #1

The removal action will meet emission levels in these regulations to the extent practicable.

16. Add the following insert for the Synopsis for Reg #5

Requires that reasonable precaution be taken to prevent

particulate matter from becoming airborne.

17. Add the following insert for the Action to Meet ARAR for Reg #5

The removal action will use good industrial practices to prevent particulate matter from becoming airborne.

18. Add the following insert for the Synopsis for Reg #7

Prohibits emissions of contaminants which may be injurious to human, plant or animal life or which unreasonable interferes with the enjoyment of life.

19. Add the following insert for the Action to Meet ARAR for Reg #7

All emissions will meet this requirement to the extent practicable.

20. Add the following insert for the Synopsis for Reg #17

Prohibits the release of objectionable odors across property lines.

21. Add the following insert for the Action to Meet ARAR for Reg #17

No Removal Action will emit objectionable odors beyond the property lines to the extent practicable.